

Message

---

**From:** Beck.Nancy@epa.gov [Beck.Nancy@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** 4/11/2019 1:16:26 AM  
**To:** Henry, Tala [Henry.Tala@epa.gov]  
**CC:** Bertrand, Charlotte [Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov]; Hamernik, Karen [Hamernik.Karen@epa.gov]; Hughes, Hayley [hughes.hayley@epa.gov]; Hanley, Mary [Hanley.Mary@epa.gov]; Keller, Kaitlin [keller.kaitlin@epa.gov]; Morris, Jeff [Morris.Jeff@epa.gov]; Stedeford, Todd [Stedeford.Todd@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** Re: STPC March Meeting Action Item 2: Recommended Actions to Improve US EPA Ecological Risk Assessment Practices

Ahh- that's it, the first WOE document.

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

\*\*\*\*\*

Nancy B. Beck, Ph.D., DABT  
Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator  
Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention  
P: 202-564-1273  
beck.nancy@epa.gov

On Apr 10, 2019, at 8:30 PM, Henry, Tala <Henry.Tala@epa.gov> wrote:

Could be:

1. RAF-Eco committee (Glen Suter led and **Karen Eisenreich** is on the Eco RAF panel) wrote purple book – it was called “weight of evidence” rather than SR

[https://cfpub.epa.gov/si/si\\_public\\_record\\_report.cfm?Lab=OSA&dirEntryId=335523](https://cfpub.epa.gov/si/si_public_record_report.cfm?Lab=OSA&dirEntryId=335523)

2. OPP has “Evaluation Guidelines for Ecological Toxicity Data Open Literature:

<https://www.epa.gov/pesticide-science-and-assessing-pesticide-risks/evaluation-guidelines-ecological-toxicity-data-open>

3. Anita Pease (OPP) and I are co-authors on a paper from a SETAC Pellston Conference on recommendations for evidence-bases ecotoxicology which outlines considerations for review of eco studies/papers for reliability & relevance.

Todd already reviewed the recommended actions and indicated back to Karen H that he had no comments

Tala R. Henry, Ph.D.  
Acting Deputy Director  
Office of Pollution Prevention and Toxics  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

T: 202-564-2959  
E: [henry.tala@epa.gov](mailto:henry.tala@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Beck, Nancy  
**Sent:** Wednesday, April 10, 2019 4:43 PM  
**To:** Bertrand, Charlotte <[Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov](mailto:Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov)>; Hamernik, Karen <[Hamernik.Karen@epa.gov](mailto:Hamernik.Karen@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Hughes, Hayley <[hughes.hayley@epa.gov](mailto:hughes.hayley@epa.gov)>; Hanley, Mary <[Hanley.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Hanley.Mary@epa.gov)>; Keller, Kaitlin <[keller.kaitlin@epa.gov](mailto:keller.kaitlin@epa.gov)>; Henry, Tala <[Henry.Tala@epa.gov](mailto:Henry.Tala@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: STPC March Meeting Action Item 2: Recommended Actions to Improve US EPA Ecological Risk Assessment Practices

Looping in Tala.

I recall recently (last 5 yrs) there was an EPA paper/whitepaper perhaps that looked at doing SR of ecological risk assessment. It was very good.

Tala- any recollection? Was it just a journal article?

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

---

Nancy B. Beck, Ph.D., DABT  
Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator, OCSPP  
P: 202-564-1273  
[beck.nancy@epa.gov](mailto:beck.nancy@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Bertrand, Charlotte  
**Sent:** Wednesday, April 10, 2019 4:31 PM  
**To:** Hamernik, Karen <[Hamernik.Karen@epa.gov](mailto:Hamernik.Karen@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Beck, Nancy <[Beck.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Beck.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Hughes, Hayley <[hughes.hayley@epa.gov](mailto:hughes.hayley@epa.gov)>; Hanley, Mary <[Hanley.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Hanley.Mary@epa.gov)>; Keller, Kaitlin <[keller.kaitlin@epa.gov](mailto:keller.kaitlin@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: STPC March Meeting Action Item 2: Recommended Actions to Improve US EPA Ecological Risk Assessment Practices

I will not have comments, Nancy?

---

**From:** Hamernik, Karen  
**Sent:** Wednesday, April 10, 2019 4:30 PM  
**To:** Bertrand, Charlotte <[Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov](mailto:Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Beck, Nancy <[Beck.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Beck.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Hughes, Hayley <[hughes.hayley@epa.gov](mailto:hughes.hayley@epa.gov)>; Hanley, Mary <[Hanley.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Hanley.Mary@epa.gov)>; Keller, Kaitlin <[keller.kaitlin@epa.gov](mailto:keller.kaitlin@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: STPC March Meeting Action Item 2: Recommended Actions to Improve US EPA Ecological Risk Assessment Practices  
**Importance:** High

Charlotte

Both OPPT and OPP have sent notes saying they will have no comments on this document.

The requested due date for a response back to OSA is Friday, April 12<sup>th</sup>, 2019.

Please let me know if the IO will have comments.

Thanks,  
Karen

<< File: 6a\_Recommended Actions to Improve ERA 2019.docx >>

**Action Item 2 of 3:**

Document: Recommended Actions to Improve US EPA Ecological Risk Assessment Practices

- **OSA is requesting approval for external release of the document to the states and tribes**
- Please provide proposal support/objection/comments for consolidation and OCSPP IO review by Tuesday April 9th, 2019.
- Please inform if your office has no comment.
- OSA has requested responses by the end of that week.

Please let me know if there are any problems.

Thanks,  
Karen

---

**From:** Hamernik, Karen

**Sent:** Tuesday, April 09, 2019 11:49 AM

**To:** Henry, Tala <[Henry.Tala@epa.gov](mailto:Henry.Tala@epa.gov)>; Lowit, Anna <[Lowit.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Lowit.Anna@epa.gov)>; Morris, Jeff <[Morris.Jeff@epa.gov](mailto:Morris.Jeff@epa.gov)>; Keigwin, Richard <[Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov)>; Dinkins, Darlene <[Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov](mailto:Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov)>; Blair, Susanna <[Blair.Susanna@epa.gov](mailto:Blair.Susanna@epa.gov)>; Pierce, Alison <[Pierce.Alison@epa.gov](mailto:Pierce.Alison@epa.gov)>; Hughes, Hayley <[hughes.hayley@epa.gov](mailto:hughes.hayley@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Bertrand, Charlotte <[Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov](mailto:Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov)>; Beck, Nancy <[Beck.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Beck.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Hanley, Mary <[Hanley.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Hanley.Mary@epa.gov)>; Keller, Kaitlin <[keller.kaitlin@epa.gov](mailto:keller.kaitlin@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: STPC March Meeting Action Item 2: Recommended Actions to Improve US EPA Ecological Risk Assessment Practices

**Importance:** High

STPC action item: Reminder on this OSA request for input as due date is the end of this week.

Thanks,  
Karen

---

**From:** Hamernik, Karen

**Sent:** Thursday, March 28, 2019 5:20 PM

**To:** Henry, Tala <[Henry.Tala@epa.gov](mailto:Henry.Tala@epa.gov)>; Lowit, Anna <[Lowit.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Lowit.Anna@epa.gov)>; Morris, Jeff <[Morris.Jeff@epa.gov](mailto:Morris.Jeff@epa.gov)>; Keigwin, Richard <[Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov)>; Dinkins, Darlene <[Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov](mailto:Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov)>; Blair, Susanna <[Blair.Susanna@epa.gov](mailto:Blair.Susanna@epa.gov)>; Pierce, Alison <[Pierce.Alison@epa.gov](mailto:Pierce.Alison@epa.gov)>; Hughes, Hayley <[hughes.hayley@epa.gov](mailto:hughes.hayley@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Bertrand, Charlotte <[Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov](mailto:Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov)>; Beck, Nancy <[Beck.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Beck.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Hanley, Mary <[Hanley.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Hanley.Mary@epa.gov)>; Keller, Kaitlin <[keller.kaitlin@epa.gov](mailto:keller.kaitlin@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: STPC March Meeting Action Item 2: Recommended Actions to Improve US EPA Ecological

## Risk Assessment Practices

**Importance:** High

### Action Item 2 of 3:

Document: Recommended Actions to Improve US EPA Ecological Risk Assessment Practices

- **OSA is requesting approval for external release of the document to the states and tribes**
- Please provide proposal support/objection/comments for consolidation and OCSPP IO review by Tuesday April 9th, 2019.
- Please inform if your office has no comment.
- OSA has requested responses by the end of that week.

Please let me know if there are any problems.

Thanks,  
Karen

---

**From:** Hamernik, Karen

**Sent:** Thursday, March 28, 2019 4:39 PM

**To:** Henry, Tala <[Henry.Tala@epa.gov](mailto:Henry.Tala@epa.gov)>; Lowit, Anna <[Lowit.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Lowit.Anna@epa.gov)>; Morris, Jeff <[Morris.Jeff@epa.gov](mailto:Morris.Jeff@epa.gov)>; Keigwin, Richard <[Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov)>; Dinkins, Darlene <[Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov](mailto:Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov)>; Blair, Susanna <[Blair.Susanna@epa.gov](mailto:Blair.Susanna@epa.gov)>; Pierce, Alison <[Pierce.Alison@epa.gov](mailto:Pierce.Alison@epa.gov)>; Hughes, Hayley <[hughes.hayley@epa.gov](mailto:hughes.hayley@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Bertrand, Charlotte <[Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov](mailto:Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov)>; Beck, Nancy <[Beck.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Beck.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Hanley, Mary <[Hanley.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Hanley.Mary@epa.gov)>; Keller, Kaitlin <[keller.kaitlin@epa.gov](mailto:keller.kaitlin@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** STPC March Meeting Action Item 1: EPA Guidelines for Human Health Hazard and Dose Response

**Importance:** High

### Action Item 1 of 3:

EPA Guidelines for Human Health Hazard and Dose Response: A Recommendation for Risk Assessment Forum (RAF) Action - 1 pager

- Please provide any input for comment consolidation and OCSPP IO review by Wednesday April 3rd, 2019.
- Please inform if your office has no comment.
- Short turn-around: OSA has requested responses by the end of that week.

<< File: 6b\_STPC-RAF Project Recommendation.03222019.docx >>

Please let me know if there are any issues.

Thanks,

Karen

---

**From:** Hamernik, Karen

**Sent:** Thursday, March 28, 2019 3:42 PM

**To:** Henry, Tala <[Henry.Tala@epa.gov](mailto:Henry.Tala@epa.gov)>; Lowit, Anna <[Lowit.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Lowit.Anna@epa.gov)>; Morris, Jeff <[Morris.Jeff@epa.gov](mailto:Morris.Jeff@epa.gov)>; Keigwin, Richard <[Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov)>; Dinkins, Darlene <[Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov](mailto:Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov)>; Blair, Susanna <[Blair.Susanna@epa.gov](mailto:Blair.Susanna@epa.gov)>; Pierce, Alison <[Pierce.Alison@epa.gov](mailto:Pierce.Alison@epa.gov)>; Hughes, Hayley <[hughes.hayley@epa.gov](mailto:hughes.hayley@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Bertrand, Charlotte <[Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov](mailto:Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov)>; Beck, Nancy <[Beck.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Beck.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Hanley, Mary <[Hanley.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Hanley.Mary@epa.gov)>; Keller, Kaitlin <[keller.kaitlin@epa.gov](mailto:keller.kaitlin@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Additional Materials from STPC March 27 Meeting

FYI: These slide sets were sent following the meeting

1. Presentation on Federal lead Action Strategy (V. Zartarian)
2. Updated presentation on Public Access Forum Metrics (K.Teichman) – additional slides included

<< File: 2\_STPC\_ORD\_Pb\_FLAP\_03-27-19\_FINAL.pdf >> << File: STPC Update 03272019 Final.pptx >>

---

**From:** Hamernik, Karen

**Sent:** Monday, March 25, 2019 10:55 AM

**To:** Henry, Tala <[Henry.Tala@epa.gov](mailto:Henry.Tala@epa.gov)>; Lowit, Anna <[Lowit.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Lowit.Anna@epa.gov)>; Morris, Jeff <[Morris.Jeff@epa.gov](mailto:Morris.Jeff@epa.gov)>; Keigwin, Richard <[Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov)>; Dinkins, Darlene <[Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov](mailto:Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov)>; Blair, Susanna <[Blair.Susanna@epa.gov](mailto:Blair.Susanna@epa.gov)>; Pierce, Alison <[Pierce.Alison@epa.gov](mailto:Pierce.Alison@epa.gov)>; Hughes, Hayley <[hughes.hayley@epa.gov](mailto:hughes.hayley@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Bertrand, Charlotte <[Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov](mailto:Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov)>; Beck, Nancy <[Beck.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Beck.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Hanley, Mary <[Hanley.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Hanley.Mary@epa.gov)>; Keller, Kaitlin <[keller.kaitlin@epa.gov](mailto:keller.kaitlin@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** STPC March 27 Meeting Current Agenda and Materials

**Importance:** High

All

- Charlotte is looking for any input prior to the Wednesday March 27, 2019 STPC meeting
- Location and Connection information highlighted in the Agenda
- Attached (under Agenda) are the latest STPC materials sent out from OSA. There could be additions or changes prior to the meeting;

- 1) Agenda
- 2) There is none
- 3a) Public Access Forum Update
- 3b) Environmental Metrology and Policy (EMAP) presentation
- 4a) The Environmental methods Forum (EMF) presentation
- 4b) EMF Members March 2019
- 5) Citizen Science Slide set
- 6a) Recommended Actions to Improve US EPA Ecological Risk Assessment Practices (March 2019 document)
- 6b) EPA Guidelines for Human Health Hazard and Dose Response – A Recommendation for RAF action

- A short clarification regarding Agenda Item 6b:

- The attached document (no. 6b: Recommended Actions to improve ERA) is NOT an Ecological Risk Assessment 5-Year Action Plan

but contains recommendations for the development of 5-year Action Plan that need to be vetted through states and tribes.

Also:

- draft notes from KH for the STPC-Science Support Panel meeting held last week

## AGENDA

### SCIENCE & TECHNOLOGY POLICY COUNCIL MEETING

Wednesday, March 27, 2019

11:00 AM – 1:00 PM ET

Conference Room (DC): Ronald Reagan Building 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Room 41213

Audio Conference Call-in Number: Conference Line/Code / Ex. 6

Conference Code: Conference Line/Code / Ex. 6

Adobe Connect Information: Conference Line/Code / Ex. 6

#### 1. Introductory Remarks and Roll Call (5 minutes, to 11:05)

Lead: Jennifer Orme-Zavaleta (Science Advisor)

Roll Call: Anand Mudambi, STPC Coordinator (OSA)

#### 2. Updates (10 minutes, to 11:15) Federal Lead Action Strategy, EPA PFAS Action Plan.

3. **Public Access Plan Metrics/Support for EPA** (25 minutes, to 11:40)

Lead: Kevin Teichman (ORD)

pose:

Inform the STPC on:

- a. Metrics developed by the Public Access Forum
- b. Prospective Master's Level student(s) available (gratis) summer/fall of 2019 to work on EPA projects.

4. **Environmental Methods Forum** (25 minutes, to 12:05)

d:

Anand Mudambi (OSA)

pose:

Brief STPC on the new standing group including its mission, goals, and objectives

Outcome:

STPC concurrence on the EMF charter

5. **Citizen Science Activities** (20 minutes, to 12:25)

Lead: Jay Benforado (OSA)

pose:

Get STPC input on future use of citizen science data in EPA activities (including regulatory programs)

come:

Reflect STPC views on uses and limitations of citizen science data in the future EPA Vision for Citizen Science

6. **RAF Updates and Discussion** (30 minutes, to 12:55)

Lead: Updates - Tom Sinks (OSA); David Bussard (ORD) & Ed Ohanian (OW)

pose:

Discuss a. Sending Eco Risk 5-year Action Plan to states and tribes for comment and b. Harmonizing EPA Approaches to Health Hazard Identification and/or Dose Response

Outcome:

a. STPC approval to send out Eco Risk Action Plan for comment.

b. STPC discussion on best ways to move forward on EPA Approaches.

7. **Summary of Action Items** (5 minutes ~, to 1:00)

ort:

Anand Mudambi (OSA)

**Next STPC Meeting:** Wednesday, June 26, 2019

<< File: 1\_Agenda March 27 STPC Meeting\_Final.docx >> << File: 3a\_Public Access STPC Update 03272019.pdf >> << File: 3b\_EMAP STPC 03272019 v2.pdf >> << File: 4a\_EMF\_STPC\_Briefing\_Mar\_2019.pptx >> << File: 4b\_EMF Members\_March 2019.docx >> << File: 5\_STPC briefing on Citizen Science - March 2019.pptx >> << File: 6a\_Recommended Actions to Improve ERA 2019.docx >> << File: 6b\_STPC-RAF Project Recommendation.03222019.docx >> << File: Draft Notes March 18 2019 STPC-SSP meeting\_KH.docx >>

---

**From:** Science and Technology Policy Council Staff

**Sent:** Friday, March 22, 2019 4:37 PM

**To:** STPC\_SSP <[STPC\\_SSP@epa.gov](mailto:STPC_SSP@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Sinks, Tom <[Sinks.Tom@epa.gov](mailto:Sinks.Tom@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** STPC March 27 Meeting: Issues and a Clarification

Dear SSP members,

- A. We have been having some issues with the STPC mailbox – this has resulted in the meeting calendar invite having multiple copies of each attachment.

I am attaching a single copy of each attachment (total 8) to this e-mail for easier viewing and printing.

- B. A short clarification regarding Agenda Item 6b:

The attached document (no. 6b: Recommended Actions to improve ERA) is NOT an Ecological Risk Assessment 5-Year Action Plan but contains recommendations for the development of 5-year Action Plan that need to be vetted through states and tribes.

- C. It appears that the Science Advisor, Dr. Orme-Zavaleta, may have to testify before Congress the day of the meeting. In that case, the Director of OSA, Dr. Tom Sinks, will chair the meeting.

Thanks for your understanding,

Anand

Anand Mudambi  
STPC Coordinator  
Office of the Science Advisor  
US EPA

Phone Number: 202-564-2817 | E-Mail: [mudambi.anand@epa.gov](mailto:mudambi.anand@epa.gov)